



Economic & International Development Department

HISTORIC LANDMARK COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES FIRST FLOOR, COUNCIL CHAMBERS CITY 1 BUILDING, 300 N. CAMPBELL STREET AUGUST 3, 2015, 4:00 P.M.

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The El Paso Historic Landmark Commission held a public hearing in the First Floor Council Chambers, City 1 Building, 300 N. Campbell Street, August 3, 2015, 4:00 p.m.

The following commissioners were present:

Chairman William Helm

Commissioner Beatriz Lucero

Commissioner Randy Brock

Commissioner George Cordova

Commissioner Melinda Becker Skillern

The following City staff members were present:

Ms. Providencia Velázquez, Historic Preservation Officer, Economic & International Development

Mr. Adam Train, Planner, Historic Preservation Office, Economic & International Development

Ms. Kristen Hamilton-Karam, Assistant City Attorney, City Attorney's Office

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Helm called the meeting to order at 4:06 p.m., quorum present.

CHANGES TO THE AGENDA

No changes were requested.

I. CALL TO THE PUBLIC – PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

II. REGULAR AGENDA – DISCUSSION AND ACTION

Certificate of Appropriateness

1. **PHAP15-00024:** Being Lots 25 to 27, All of Blocks, Manhattan Heights Addition, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location: 3200 Copper Avenue
Historic District: Manhattan Heights
Property Owner: City of El Paso
Representative: Ben Fyffe
Representative District: 2
Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built: 1995

Economic & International Development
City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094
ED@elpasotexas.gov

“Delivering Outstanding Services”



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Historic Status:	Non-Contributing
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a mosaic mural on an exterior wall after-the-fact
Application Filed:	7/6/15
45 Day Expiration:	8/20/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a mosaic mural on an exterior wall after-the-fact. The addition, on which the mosaic mural is attached, was built in 2011/2013 with a great deal of input regarding the construction of the addition from the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association. Ms. Velázquez was notified of this mosaic mural via email approximately two weeks ago. The sender asked Ms. Velázquez why the neighborhood association was not informed of it. The reason why the neighborhood association was not informed of the mosaic mural was because she had not received the application for it.

Ms. Velázquez contacted the MCAD (Museums and Cultural Affairs Department) and questioned them regarding the mosaic. Ms. Velázquez was told yes, this was a community project with the assistance of the library and certain schools working together to reach this decision. Ms. Velázquez met with MCAD and provided MCAD with options including relocating it on the interior which is not designated and would not have to go through a public hearing. Instead, MCAD staff chose to appear before the Commission.

Photos of the mosaic were shown and the mosaic is not complete; however, it is more complete than not.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends ***DENIAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Painting or applying coatings such as cement or stucco to exposed masonry/stone is not appropriate, because it will change the historic appearance of the masonry/stone feature, and can accelerate deterioration.*
- *Preservation, restoration, or reconstruction of a structure's original fixtures is recommended.*
- *Preserve the shape, size, materials, and details of character-defining chimneys and foundations and other masonry/stone features.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*



Economic & International Development Department

Chairman Helm asked if this was the first time a public art project has come before the Historic Landmark Commission.

Ms. Velázquez replied no; usually the art projects are located in Downtown. The former City Council representative for this district had requested in March 2011 to bring all public items to the Landmark Commission to ensure the projects were brought before the public for public comment. Ms. Velázquez noted the entrance to the library faces Copper Street. Ms. Velázquez explained all historic districts are required to submit applications for Certificates of Appropriateness for all new construction, except the Downtown Historic District. That exception was enacted via an interpretation from the City Attorney's Office declaring non-contributing properties in the Downtown historic district did not have to come before the Commission. Ms. Velázquez explained the Certificate of Appropriateness for the first design for the library addition came before commissioners; however, that decision was appealed by the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association and other residents because the public was not given the opportunity to comment on the design. The Engineering Department designed the addition but neglected to verify the design with the neighborhood association and the association felt their input should have been included. The project went before City Council then came back to Historic Landmark Commission with a new design.

Mr. Ben Fyffe, Assistant Director, MCAD, said this project is technically not a public art project; however, this project was funded via the community art's project. This mosaic mural is one of eight completed projects. Mr. Fyffe explained the process by which artists and their projects are selected and funded. Mr. Fyffe explained he was unaware the mosaic mural should have come before commissioners prior to starting the project; however, when he was contacted by Ms. Velázquez to stop work, work on the project stopped. Mr. Fyffe assured commissioners, anytime in the future, work done on libraries located in historic districts would follow proper procedure. Mr. Fyffe explained an announcement was sent out to the community as a regular library branch function. Based on that announcement, 83 community members were present for the initial event to paint and glaze tiles. Mr. Fyffe apologized for not following procedure; however, he asked commissioners to allow the exception for the mosaic mural project.

Ms. Kathryn Gelinas, mosaic mural artist, explained the mosaic, as it currently exists, has received a great deal of positive feedback. She stated the tiles are attached to the exterior of the building using Reliabond Mastic, an industrial strength ceramic tile adhesive. Removing the tiles would not damage the brick.

Mayor

Oscar Leaser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

ED@elpasotexas.gov

"Delivering Outstanding Services"



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The following members of the public commented:

1. Mr. Ray Rutledge, property owner and member of the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association, stated there was no outreach from the library to the association. Mr. Rutledge commented on the initial design of the library addition and with the input from the neighborhood association, the addition design is now much more consistent with the original prairie style design. Entering Memorial Park from Copia Street, this library is one of the first buildings you see; furthermore, Copia Street is one of the main thoroughfares through the park and into the historic district. Mr. Rutledge stated MCAD and the library director were very much aware the library is located in a historic district. Mr. Rutledge was concerned that approving the mosaic would set a precedent.
2. Ms. Julie Rutledge, property owner and Board Member of the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association, was unsure how many of the 83 participants resided in the historic district. She proposed placing the mosaic on a freestanding monument, not attached to the building, rather than on the exterior of the building. Ms. Rutledge explained that to prevent individuals and entities from using the excuse they were not aware their property(ies) were located in the historic district, all street signs say Manhattan Heights Historic District.

To clarify, Mr. Fyffe stated four out of the previous eight mosaic murals are located on the exterior of the buildings, not only libraries.

Commissioner Lucero wondered what lessons, if any, has MCAD learned from this experience.

Mr. Fyffe explained the lessons learned are anytime property is located within a historic district staff will take the necessary extra steps to complete the process effectively and efficiently.

Commissioner Cordova clarified, regarding the addition to the library, when applying for the building permits, library staff had to meet with Ms. Velázquez prior to receiving said building permits. Therefore, library staff was aware the library was located in a historic district.

Commissioner Lucero asked if commissioners deny the request would the tiles need to be removed.

Ms. Velázquez replied yes or MCAD could appeal the denial decision to the City Council.

Mr. Fyffe noted should commissioners deny the request he would appeal the decision to the City Council.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Commissioner Lucero agreed with the neighborhood association that they should have been notified of and included in discussions regarding the project. She felt the mosaic mural added life to the structure.

Commissioner Cordova agreed with Commissioner Lucero the mosaic mural did add life to the structure. However, he was not convinced MCAD staff were unaware the library was located within the historic district due to staff previously submitting application paperwork to allow the construction of this library addition structure.

Mr. Fyffe clarified the libraries were not under the MCAD umbrella at the time the request for the addition was approved. He explained staff knew the property was located within the historic district boundaries; however, staff was unaware of its significance. He apologized and added that for any future projects located within a historic district he will follow proper procedure when submitting documents to the Historic Preservation Officer.

Ms. Hamilton-Karam reminded the commission even though this is an after-the-fact application, the fact that they did not apply previously is not to be used as a punishment.

Ms. Velázquez recalled the Arts Plaza in Downtown was the last public art project that came before commissioners, that was approximately one year ago. Additionally, that project came before commissioners as an after-the-fact submittal.

Regarding the punishment comment made by Ms. Hamilton-Karam, Ms. Julie Rutledge wondered if commissioners would have approved the project if MCAD and library staff had followed proper application procedure.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Cordova, seconded by Commissioner Skillern AND CARRIED TO FOLLOW THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATIONS.

AYES: *Commissioner Brock, Commissioner Cordova and Commissioner Skillern*

NAYS: *Commissioner Lucero and Chairman Helm*

Motion passed. (3-2)



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

2. PHAP15-00025:	Being 32 Sunset Heights 1 To 30, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
Location:	220 Lawton Drive
Historic District:	Sunset Heights
Property Owner:	El Paso Independent School District
Representative:	Adrian Stresow
Representative District:	8
Existing Zoning:	R-2/H (Residential/Historic)
Year Built:	1940
Historic Status:	Landmark
Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of playgrounds
Application Filed:	7/6/15
45 Day Expiration:	8/20/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of playgrounds. The property, Vilas Elementary School, has been undergoing quite a few changes due to an increase in student population. The playground will be located behind the main structure next to the new parking lot and the new playfield with the artificial grass. The new parking lot and the new playfield with the artificial grass projects were presented and approved by commissioners earlier this summer. Because this is a public project using public funds, the project is being presented to commissioners to allow public comment.

Chairman Helm asked what material the ground covering was composed of.

Mr. Joel Olivas, Project Manager for El Paso Independent School District (EPISD), stated the ground covering material would be rubberized poured and in-place material.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Place non-traditional site features such as swimming pools, playground equipment, concrete pads and basketball goals, tree houses, dumpsters, and trash receptacles only in areas such as rear yards, where they are not visible from the street.*
- *All new construction (including detached infill and additions to existing structures) should preserve and enhance the streetscape by appropriately addressing the elements of the historic streetscape.*
- *New construction on a lot must be compatible in scale, setbacks, size, massing, and materials to the adjacent properties.*



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

Chairman Helm wondered why the installation of the playground was not included in the two projects previously approved by commissioners earlier in the summer.

Mr. Olivas explained this project, the playground equipment, was originally part of a three-part project which included the drop off zone (new parking lot) and new playfield with artificial turf. The playground was in the design phase and could not be included in the original projects request.

Chairman Helm asked if there were any members of the public who wished to comment on the project. There were none.

Mr. Olivas added he is in receipt of an email from the Sunset Heights Neighborhood Improvement Association stating their support for the Vilas Elementary Playground Shade Canopy. *(For the record, a copy of the email is on file.)*

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE BASED ON STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION FOR APPROVAL.

- 3. PHAP15-00026:** Being 47 Ysleta Tr. 6-E (0.2800 Ac.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- | | |
|--------------------------|---|
| Location: | 105 Juno Place |
| Historic District: | Ysleta |
| Property Owner: | Eric Apodaca |
| Representative: | Eric Apodaca |
| Representative District: | 6 |
| Existing Zoning: | R-4/H (Residential/Historic) |
| Year Built: | 1959 |
| Historic Status: | Non-contributing |
| Request: | Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an addition and additional structures in the rear yard and construction of a new addition after-the-fact |
| Application Filed: | 7/21/15 |
| 45 Day Expiration: | 9/4/15 |



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the demolition of an addition and additional structures in the rear yard and construction of a new addition after-the-fact. The property is located on the corner at the very edge of the historic district. Photos of the property from the last survey taken in 2000 and recently were shown. The proposed addition is a little bit larger with an attached pergola and a cement pad underneath. Originally, the property owner wanted to get a permit to install solar panels on the property. Ms. Velázquez asked the property owner to provide photos of the proposed location of the solar panels. While reviewing the photos, she realized the property owner had started new construction on the proposed addition. Ms. Velázquez asked the property owner what was originally there and he explained it was an addition that he had demolished without a permit. During the demolition the addition sustained damage; therefore, the property owner had not continued construction. However, he had not applied for permits nor had he submitted paperwork for a Certificate of Appropriateness. Ms. Velázquez requested the property owner submit drawings showing how the proposed addition would look. The addition will be very simple with a stucco exterior, the roofline will match the original, the added pergola and the cement pad. Floor plans and elevation plans were shown to commissioners. Ms. Velázquez noted the property owner had demolished, without permits, other structures on the property.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends ***APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Height of new buildings should conform to the heights of existing surrounding buildings. Avoid overwhelming the original massing with excessive additions (heights). Excessive additions can detract from the architectural character of a building.*
- *The relationship between the height and width of a building establishes proportion. The proportions of new buildings should be consistent with the dominant proportions of existing buildings.*
- *New construction of additions to existing structures should maintain and reinforce the existing pattern.*
- *Since some secondary buildings were usually built at the same time and in the same style as the primary structure, they contribute to the architectural character of the property.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.*



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Chairman Helm asked what portion of the addition could be seen from the street.

Via the photos, Ms. Velázquez clarified what can and cannot be seen from the street. The levee is public right-of-way but not within the boundaries of the district. The district line is located right at the end of this property owner's property line. Ms. Velázquez stated she has not recommended any modifications for this request.

Commissioner Lucero wondered what color the stucco would be.

Ms. Velázquez replied she will recommend a color to match the existing stucco.

Mr. Eric Apodaca, property owner, explained his drainage had collapsed and so the foundation had sunk which explains the necessary repairs. He was unaware of the requirements of the historic district and procedures of the Historic Preservation Office. The color of the stucco resembles the color of the surrounding buildings in the area.

Chairman Helm asked if there was anyone in the audience who wished to comment on this request. There was none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Brock, seconded by Commissioner Cordova AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE.

- 4. PHAP15-00028:** The alley between Aurora, Wheeling, Elm, and Louisiana, City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: Aurora, Wheeling, Elm, and Louisiana Alleyway
- Historic District: Manhattan Heights
- Property Owner: El Paso Electric
- Representative: William Pollard
- Representative District: 2
- Existing Zoning: R-3/H (Residential/Historic)
- Year Built: N/A
- Historic Status: N/A
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of 2.4kv feeders with 13.8kv system, which consists of re-conductoring lines, pole replacement, and pole installation
- Application Filed: 7/29/15
- 45 Day Expiration: 9/12/15



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the applicant is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the replacement of 2.4kv feeders with 13.8kv system, which consists of re-conductoring lines, pole replacement, and pole installation. The project does occur on public right-of-way. Ms. Velázquez received notification via email from the City Representative's staff asking Ms. Velázquez if she was aware of the project that the Electric Company was working on in the Manhattan Heights Historic District. Ms. Velázquez replied no, she was not aware of any projects and notified the El Paso Electric Company to cease all construction. Ms. Velázquez noted the Electric Company responded to her notification very quickly.

For the record, Ms. Velázquez read the following information from a letter written by Mr. William Pollard, Superintendent/ Distribution Systems, El Paso Electric Company.

"The area is currently served by 2.4 KV feeders and the new construction will provide a 13.8 KV system to meet our projections of our customer's loads. These increased load projections are primarily due to the conversions to refrigerated air conditions systems. The work within the Manhattan Heights Historical District will consist of a re-conductoring of our lines and pole replacements in the alley between Aurora, Wheeling, Elm and Louisiana as shown on the attached map as poles 8 through 12. The work will also include the placement of a new pole line located along and within the street right of way of Elm Street which are shown on the attached maps as poles 1 through 7. Poles 1, 3, 5 and 7 will be placed as interceptors to connect to our existing circuits in the alleys. Poles 2 and 6 will provide street clearance and will replace existing street light poles at their locations. Pole 4 will provide street clearances."





Economic & International Development Department

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Mechanical equipment should be installed in the least-visibly obtrusive location on the building, preferably at the rear of the building.*
- *In no case should mechanical equipment be installed on a visually-prominent point on a roof or where it becomes the most noticeable component of the building.*
- *If a new mechanical system is needed, install it so that it causes the least amount of alteration to the building's exterior façades, historic building fabric, and site features.*
- *Locate new mechanical equipment and utilities, including heating and air-conditioning units, meters, exposed pipes, and fuel tanks, in the most inconspicuous area, usually along a building's rear façade, screen from public view.*
- *It is not appropriate to install mechanical equipment in locations that compromise character defining roofs or on roof slopes that are prominently visible from the street.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*

Mr. William Pollard, Superintendent/Distribution Systems, El Paso Electric Company, explained the purpose of this process is to be informative; to inform the public and commissioners of the deficiency in the electrical network around the Manhattan Heights Historic District. There will also be new construction and upgrades within and around the historic district. The project is designed to improve the efficiencies and reliability within the area. The most prudent route to accomplish that is utilizing Elm Street and intercepting existing facilities near Wheeling and the alley between Aurora and Wheeling and conclude at some facilities toward Alabama.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Pollard to explain the red, blue and green dots on the map (*shown on previous page*).

Mr. Pollard spoke in detail regarding the map and reiterated the El Paso Electric Company is currently operating under the current Franchise Agreement with the utilities in the right-of-way to install facilities in this area as well as up north on Elm Street and up toward Savannah, outside the historic district.

The following members of the public spoke in opposition to the request:

1. Juan Garza, 2734 Louisville, and an affected resident;

Mr. Pollard explained the Electric Company would assist Mr. Garza with the trimming/pruning of his large backyard tree.

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

ED@elpasotexas.gov

"Delivering Outstanding Services"

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

2. Saul Arriola, resident of the historic district, gave a presentation on behalf of the Manhattan Heights Neighborhood Association and himself; additionally, the neighborhood association supports his point of view as written in his statement (*for the record a copy of Mr. Arriola's statement is on file*).

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Pollard if the Electric Company had considered alternative routes other than Elm Street.

Mr. Pollard replied yes, we have considered other routes using Alabama, Louisiana and Piedras; however, those options proved cost prohibitive and extensive engineering and physical structures are excessive in those cases. El Paso Electric Company found Elm Street was by far the most prudent solution for the options being pursued. Mr. Pollard believed that coming before commissioners today was an opportunity to inform the public/community regarding this project. El Paso Electric Company is operating under the utility easements.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez if commissioners normally review utility and construction upgrades.

Ms. Velázquez stated we review everything within historic districts.

Commissioner Lucero asked Ms. Velázquez what her recommendations were.

After listening to the property owners and the El Paso Electric Company, Ms. Velázquez suggested commissioners not make a decision today. Instead have commissioners ask the El Paso Electric Company to meet with the neighborhood association members and property owners and perhaps develop a compromise before the next HLC meeting on August 17th.

Mr. Eddie Gutierrez, Vice-President, External Affairs, El Paso Electric Company, concurred with Ms. Velázquez in postponing the request to the next scheduled meeting. He noted the last time the El Paso Electric Company brought information before the Historic Landmark Commission was in 2005 and that information did not require approval from the commission. Under the current Right-of-Way Easement Agreement EPEC researched all options and found installation within Elm Street right-of-way the most prudent. Should commissioners deny the request, El Paso Electric would appeal that decision to the City Council. In conclusion, Mr. Gutierrez stated El Paso Electric Company does have the right under the current Easement Agreement to access.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Lucero AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO POSTPONE UNTIL THE NEXT REGULARLY SCHEDULED HLC MEETING.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

5. **PHAP15-00029:** Being 3 Sunset Heights 18 & N. ½ of 19 (4066 sq. ft.), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- Location: 1122 N. El Paso Street
- Historic District: Sunset Heights
- Property Owner: Jorge Fitzmaurice
- Representative: Jorge Fitzmaurice
- Representative District: 8
- Existing Zoning: A-3/H (Apartments/Historic)
- Year Built: 1910
- Historic Status: Contributing
- Request: Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of second floor porch enclosure and installation of iron balustrade and columns; installation of sconces; removal of clay tile at front porch entrance and installation of asphalt shingle; modification of a window opening to accommodate a door; and repainting brick in "Thunder Gray"
- Application Filed: 7/27/15
- 45 Day Expiration: 9/10/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the removal of second floor porch enclosure and installation of iron balustrade and columns; installation of sconces; removal of clay tile at front porch entrance and installation of asphalt shingle; modification of a window opening to accommodate a door; and repainting brick in "Thunder Gray." While photos of the property were shown, Ms. Velázquez noted the enclosed porch was not original to this 1910 structure. She stated the property owner wants to convert the structure into an apartment building containing four apartments and restore the structure to its original configuration. She added many changes have taken place regarding this property over the years; however, there are enough of the original components left to retain its integrity. Per the elevations, the property owner plans to remove the enclosures from those porches, to restore the windows and doors that are there (which are wood and may be the original to the property) and to install iron balustrades throughout the entire structure for continuity as far as construction materials. Where there are original doors and windows, the property owner will keep them and restore them. A few window openings would be modified to accommodate doors. Ms. Velázquez felt the proposed color to repaint the bricks, selected by the property owner, may be too dark for the neighborhood. Additionally, the property owner wants to remove the clay barrel tile above the entrance and replace with asphalt shingle to match the existing roof.

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

ED@elpasotexas.gov

"Delivering Outstanding Services"



Economic & International Development Department

The Historic Preservation Office recommends ***APPROVAL WITH MODIFICATIONS** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Replace a missing or deteriorated historic exterior lighting fixture with fixtures that are similar in appearance, material, and scale to the original and historic character of the building and the streetscape.*
- *Introduce new site and street lighting that are compatible with the human scale and the historic character of the district. Consider the location, design, material, size, color, finish, scale, and brightness of a proposed fixture in determining its compatibility.*
- *Neutral tones and muted earth colors are strongly recommended for the main body of the structure. Trim color may be a darker or contrasting color than the body of the building. Paint colors must be of the period, times, architectural style of the building, and geographic location because what works for a color palette for a home in California does not necessarily fit with paint colors in El Paso.*
- *When repainting, select paint colors that are compatible with the historic building and district. Enhance the features of a building through appropriate selection and placement of paint color consistent with its architectural style.*
- *The distinctive features of each roof type should be retained as they are character-defining elements. If a roof requires repair, the replacement materials must match the original or existing materials as closely as possible. Do not change the style or construction of the roof.*
- *New doors and windows should be constructed to fit into the existing opening. New construction should utilize doors and windows of compatible size, style, and material in an appropriate pattern so as not to detract from the historical significance of the existing building.*
- *Porches are functional as well as decorative features that help to define the overall character of a building. Many buildings feature porches, which are one of the most common architectural features.*
- *Enclosure of a porch is not appropriate.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.*
- *New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.*

***THE MODIFICATIONS ARE THAT THE PAINT COLOR BE A LIGHTER SHADE OF GRAY, THAT A SIMPLER SCONCE DESIGN BE APPROVED, AND THAT THE CLAY BARREL TILE ABOVE THE FRONT DOOR BE RETAINED.**

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development

City 3 | 801 Texas Avenue | El Paso, Texas 79901 | (915) 212-0094

ED@elpasotexas.gov

"Delivering Outstanding Services"



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Mr. Jorge Fitzmaurice, property owner, regarding the darker gray color:

1. The position of the house will get a lot of sun and with the dirt and the sun, the color of the exterior will eventually fade into a very light color in two or three years, at the most. Based on his experience, he thought a darker gray color would be appropriate.
2. Regarding the clay barrel tile above the entrance, Mr. Fitzmaurice did not think they were conforming to the historical period of the structure. He would like to remove the clay tile and replace with the shingles he has currently on the roof.

Mr. Fitzmaurice concurred with Ms. Velázquez's recommendations otherwise.

Regarding the color selection, Ms. Velázquez explained she and Mr. Fitzmaurice have discussed this previously. As an option, she proposed finding a red brick color because there is brick beneath the paint. Mr. Fitzmaurice tried removing the paint but was unsuccessful.

Chairman Helm asked Ms. Velázquez what process commissioners should recommend regarding selecting a simpler sconce.

Ms. Velázquez replied Mr. Fitzmaurice presented three samples of sconces and she and Mr. Fitzmaurice would work together selecting the appropriate sconce. Regarding the paint color, however, she recommended a lighter, certainly a more neutral tone. Should commissioners approve the request with modifications, she would work with Mr. Fitzmaurice on the selection of sconces and color and approve administratively.

Chairman Helm asked if there was anyone in the audience who wished to speak on this request. There were none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Cordova AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE BASED ON STAFF'S RECOMMENDATIONS.

- 6. PHAP15-00030:** Being Lot 17 Mills, Pt. of Block Beginning 95.08' SW of Nec. (13.17') and 17 Mills Se. Pt. of Blk (87.50' on N – 150.00' on E), City of El Paso, El Paso County, Texas
- | | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Location: | 123 W. Mills Avenue and 303 N. Oregon Street |
| Historic District: | Downtown |
| Property Owner: | Mills Plaza Properties, LP |
| Representative: | Brent Harris |
| Representative District: | 8 |
| Existing Zoning: | C-5/H (Commercial/Historic) |
| Year Built: | 1910 |
| Historic Status: | Landmark |



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Request:	Certificate of Appropriateness for right-of-way improvements including the installation of planters, benches, pavers, sidewalk, railing, tables, chairs, kiosk, bike racks, steps, lighting, and landscaping
Application Filed:	7/30/15
45 Day Expiration:	9/14/15

Ms. Velázquez gave a presentation and stated the property owner is requesting a Certificate of Appropriateness for right-of-way improvements including the installation of planters, benches, pavers, sidewalk, railing, tables, chairs, kiosk, bike racks, steps, lighting, and landscaping in front of the Mills Building. Commissioners have reviewed proposals for improvements to a right-of-way previously for the Mills Building. This request for right-of-way improvements is part of the revitalization of the area which includes the San Jacinto Plaza, the Arts Plaza, and the Mills Avenue enhancement. Ms. Velázquez showed slides of the proposed enhancements and stated the project is rather extensive but it would not impact the building itself. The sidewalk has to accommodate for access because of the slight difference in height.

The Historic Preservation Office recommends **APPROVAL** of the proposed scope of work based on the following recommendations:

The Design Guidelines for El Paso's Historic Districts, Sites, and Properties recommend the following:

- *Sidewalks should be enhanced by installing brick pavers (or other decorative materials) along the edges and/or intersections.*
- *Generally fencing should be of brick and/or wrought iron.*
- *Trees should have tree grates and vertical tree guards similar to those at Pioneer Plaza.*
- *"Street furniture" usually refers to all outdoor stationary objects except for buildings and vegetation and represents all those manmade objects having the "potential for enlivening and giving variety to streets, sidewalks, plazas, and other outdoor spaces open to, and used by, the public." Street furniture should be consistent with the character of the historic landmarks within the district.*
- *Consolidating existing street furniture should also be considered. Traffic signs, lamp posts, trash receptacles, parking meters and mail boxes can clutter downtown sidewalks.*

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation recommend the following:

- *Exterior alterations will not destroy historic materials, features, and spatial relationships that characterize the property.*

**Mayor**

Oscar Leeser

City Council*District 1*

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

Economic & International Development Department

Chairman Helm asked if the same design team designed the San Jacinto Plaza and the Arts Plaza projects. As part of this project, would there be a reconfiguration of Mills Avenue into two lanes.

Ms. Velázquez replied yes, SWA. She explained the city did approve a vacation of Mills Avenue several years ago approved a more pedestrian plaza for Mills.

Ms. Hamilton-Karam explained the street location, Mills Avenue to Oregon Street to the Plaza Theater, is currently vacated by the city to vehicular traffic. The sidewalk area was dedicated to the Mills Building just last week. However, the street itself is a right-of-way for the city. As far as vehicular traffic, the city council has not made a decision to reopen Mills Avenue.

Mr. Richard Bransford, Franklin Home Management, explained the right-of-way vacation includes the large drop off areas with pavers. This project has been in the works for a while and has evolved to this stage and is ready to go.

Chairman Helm clarified the drop off areas will have different colored pavers than the primary paver and asked Mr. Bransford if there would be a grade change, would the curb line be cut in.

Mr. Bransford explained the curb line in front of the Anson Restaurant, the current curb line, the drop area is pretty large. But in order to create more space for pedestrians to walk along the sidewalk, the drop area will be reduced, to the east.

Chairman Helm asked Mr. Bransford if, by this design, the city would allow vehicular traffic on Mills Avenue again.

Mr. Bransford did not have an answer for the Chairman. What this project entails is improvements on the right-of-way portion, installing pavers, enhancing sidewalks, handrails and adding vegetation. These improvements extend past the Plaza Theatre on the one side and all the way up past the Community Foundation.

Chairman Helm asked what is the general materials palette?

Mr. Bransford responded this material is similar to the San Jacinto and Arts Plaza: greens, patinas, and dark brown rust colors.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE BASED ON STAFF RECOMMENDATIONS.



Economic & International Development Department

Mayor

Oscar Leeser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez

7. Addresses of property HLC commissioners have requested that HLC staff review or investigate and provide a report to the HLC. If no addresses are submitted in advance and listed under this agenda item, commissioners may announce such addresses under this agenda item. Discussion on property announced at this meeting will take place during the next regularly scheduled meeting. August 3, 2015 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be scheduled for the August 17, 2015 meeting. August 17, 2015 deadline for HLC members to request for agenda items to be schedule for the September 14, 2015 meeting.

No address requests from commissioners for staff to review or investigate.

HLC Staff Report

8. Update on Administrative Review Cases since the last HLC meeting for the properties listed on the attachment posted with this agenda. (See Attachment "A")

No comments from commissioners.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Chairman Helm AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE HLC STAFF REPORT.

Other Business – Discussion and Action

9. Discussion on Downtown survey and map (per 11.24.2014 meeting discussion) including discussion of Certified Local Government (CLG) grant

Ms. Velázquez informed commissioners that, after a review at City Council, the City of El Paso is returning the \$56,000 grant monies to the Texas Historical Commission and the matching \$15,000 monies from the Summerlee Foundation. Public outreach meetings will continue. Staff will periodically update commissioners regarding the progress of these public outreach meetings.

10. Approval of Regular Meeting Minutes for June 15 and July 6, 2015

JUNE 15TH MEETING MINUTES

Chairman Helm asked commissioners if they had any additions, corrections and/or revisions. There were none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Becker Skillern AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE JUNE 15, 2015 HLC MEETING MINUTES.



Economic & International Development Department

JULY 6TH MEETING MINUTES

Chairman Helm asked commissioners if they had any additions, corrections and/or revisions. There were none.

MOTION:

Motion made by Chairman Helm, seconded by Commissioner Becker Skillern AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO APPROVE THE JULY 6, 205 HLC MEETING MINUTES.

MOTION:

Motion made by Commissioner Lucero, seconded by Commissioner Brock AND UNANIMOUSLY CARRIED TO ADJOURN THE MEETING AT 6:05 P.M.

Mayor

Oscar Leaser

City Council

District 1

Peter Svarzbein

District 2

Larry Romero

District 3

Emma Acosta

District 4

Carl L. Robinson

District 5

Dr. Michiel R. Noe

District 6

Claudia Ordaz

District 7

Lily Limón

District 8

Cortney C. Niland

City Manager

Tommy Gonzalez